

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of : Case No. 14-1505
The Dayton Power and Light Company for : Appeal from the Public Utilities
Approval of Its Electric Security Plan, etc. : Commission of Ohio
: Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
: Case Nos. 12-426-EL-SSO,
: 12-427-EL-ATA,
: 12-428-EL-AAM,
: 12-429-EL-WVR, and
: 12-672-EL-RDR

**APPENDIX TO THE FOURTH BRIEF OF CROSS-APPELLANT
THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY**

Judi L. Sobecki (0067186)
THE DAYTON POWER AND
LIGHT COMPANY
1065 Woodman Drive
Dayton, OH 45432
Telephone: (937) 259-7171
Telecopier: (937) 259-7178
Email: judi.sobecki@dplinc.com

Charles J. Faruki (0010417)
(Counsel of Record)
Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)
Christopher C. Hollon (0086480)
FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.
500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W.
10 North Ludlow Street
Dayton, OH 45402
Telephone: (937) 227-3705
Telecopier: (937) 227-3717
Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com
jsharkey@ficlaw.com
chollon@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for Cross-Appellant
The Dayton Power and Light Company

Samuel C. Randazzo (0016386)
(Counsel of Record)
Frank P. Darr (0025469)
Matthew R. Pritchard (0088070)
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Telephone: 614.469.8000
Telecopier: 614.719.2840
Email: sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Appellant
Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Michael DeWine (0009181)
Ohio Attorney General

William L. Wright (0018010)
Section Chief
(Counsel of Record)
Thomas W. McNamee (0017352)
Werner L. Margard (0024858)
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
Telephone: 614.466.4397
Telecopier: 614.644.8764
Email: William.wright@puc.state.oh.us
Thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us
Werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us

Attorneys for Appellee
The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

Maureen R. Grady, Esq. (0020847)
(Counsel of Record)
Terri L. Etter (0067445)
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of The Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
Telephone: 614.466.9567 (Grady)
Telecopier: 614.466.9475
Email: Maureen.grady@occ.ohio.gov
Terry.etter@occ.ohio.gov

Attorneys for Appellant
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Colleen L. Mooney, Esq.
Ohio Partners For Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45840
Telephone: 419.425.8860
Telecopier: 419.425.8862
Email: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Attorney for Amicus Curiae
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

Ellis Jacobs, Esq.
Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc.
130 West First Street, Suite 700 East
Dayton, OH 45402
Telephone: 937.535.4419
Telecopier: 937.535.4600
Email: ejacobs@ablelaw.org

Attorney for Amicus Curiae
Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page(s)</u>
<u>CONSTITUTIONAL PROVISIONS, STATUTES AND RULES</u>	
<u>Ohio Constitution</u>	
Article IV, Section 2.....	00087
<u>Ohio Revised Code</u>	
R.C. 2505.02.....	00089

which all interested parties may appear and be represented, shall determine the question of disability. The court shall make its determination within twenty-one days after presentment of such resolution.

If the governor transmits to the Supreme Court a written declaration that the disability no longer exists, the Supreme Court shall, after public hearing at which all interested parties may appear and be represented, determine the question of the continuation of the disability. The court shall make its determination within twenty-one days after transmittal of such declaration.

The Supreme Court has original, exclusive, and final jurisdiction to determine all questions concerning succession to the office of the governor or to its powers and duties.

(1976)

ARTICLE IV: JUDICIAL

JUDICIAL POWER VESTED IN COURT.

§1 The judicial power of the state is vested in a supreme court, courts of appeals, courts of common pleas and divisions thereof, and such other courts inferior to the Supreme Court as may from time to time be established by law.

(1851, am. 1883, 1912, 1968, 1973)

ORGANIZATION AND JURISDICTION OF SUPREME COURT.

§2 (A) The Supreme Court shall, until otherwise provided by law, consist of seven judges, who shall be known as the chief justice and justices. In case of the absence or disability of the chief

justice, the judge having the period of longest total service upon the court shall be the acting chief justice. If any member of the court shall be unable, by reason of illness, disability or disqualification, to hear, consider and decide a cause or causes, the chief justice or the acting chief justice may direct any judge of any court of appeals to sit with the judges of the Supreme Court in the place and stead of the absent judge. A majority of the Supreme Court shall be necessary to constitute a quorum or to render a judgment.

(B)(1) The Supreme Court shall have original jurisdiction in the following:

- (a) Quo warranto;
- (b) Mandamus;
- (c) Habeas corpus;
- (d) Prohibition;
- (e) Procedendo;
- (f) In any cause on review as may be necessary to its complete determination;
- (g) Admission to the practice of law, the discipline of persons so admitted, and all other matters relating to the practice of law.

(2) The Supreme Court shall have appellate jurisdiction as follows:

- (a) In appeals from the courts of appeals as a matter of right in the following:
 - (i) Cases originating in the courts of appeals;
 - (ii) Cases in which the death penalty has been affirmed;
 - (iii) Cases involving questions arising under the constitution of the United States or of this state.
- (b) In appeals from the courts of appeals in cases of felony on leave first obtained.

- (c) In direct appeals from the courts of common pleas or other courts of record inferior to the court of appeals as a matter of right in cases in which the death penalty has been imposed.
- (d) Such revisory jurisdiction of the proceedings of administrative officers or agencies as may be conferred by law;
- (e) In cases of public or great general interest, the Supreme Court may direct any court of appeals to certify its record to the Supreme Court, and may review and affirm, modify, or reverse the judgment of the court of appeals;
- (f) The Supreme Court shall review and affirm, modify, or reverse the judgment in any case certified by any court of appeals pursuant to section 3(B)(4) of this article.

(3) No law shall be passed or rule made whereby any person shall be prevented from invoking the original jurisdiction of the Supreme Court.

(C) The decisions in all cases in the Supreme Court shall be reported together with the reasons therefor.

(1851, am. 1883, 1912, 1944, 1968, 1994)

ORGANIZATION AND JURISDICTION OF COURT OF APPEALS.

§3 (A) The state shall be divided by law into compact appellate districts in each of which there shall be a court of appeals consisting of three judges. Laws may be passed increasing the number of judges in any district where in the volume of business may require such additional judge or judges. In districts having additional judges, three judges shall participate in the hearing

and disposition of each case. The court shall hold sessions in each county of the district as the necessity arises. The county commissioners of each county shall provide a proper and convenient place for the court of appeals to hold court.

(B)(1) The courts of appeals shall have original jurisdiction in the following:

- (a) Quo warranto;
- (b) Mandamus;
- (c) Habeas corpus;
- (d) Prohibition;
- (e) Procedendo
- (f) In any cause on review as may be necessary to its complete determination.

(2) Courts of appeals shall have such jurisdiction as may be provided by law to review and affirm, modify, or reverse judgments or final orders of the courts of record inferior to the court of appeals within the district, except that courts of appeals shall not have jurisdiction to review on direct appeal a judgement that imposes a sentence of death. Courts of appeals shall have such appellate jurisdiction as may be provided by law to review and affirm, modify, or reverse final orders or actions of administrative officers or agencies.

(3) A majority of the judges hearing the cause shall be necessary to render a judgment. Judgments of the courts of appeals are final except as provided in section 2(B)(2) of the article. No judgment resulting from a trial by jury shall be reversed on the weight of the evidence except by the concurrence of all three judges hearing the cause.

(4) Whenever the judges of a court of appeals find that a judgment upon

2505.02 Final orders.

(A) As used in this section:

(1) "Substantial right" means a right that the United States Constitution, the Ohio Constitution, a statute, the common law, or a rule of procedure entitles a person to enforce or protect.

(2) "Special proceeding" means an action or proceeding that is specially created by statute and that prior to 1853 was not denoted as an action at law or a suit in equity.

(3) "Provisional remedy" means a proceeding ancillary to an action, including, but not limited to, a proceeding for a preliminary injunction, attachment, discovery of privileged matter, suppression of evidence, a prima-facie showing pursuant to section 2307.85 or 2307.86 of the Revised Code, a prima-facie showing pursuant to section 2307.92 of the Revised Code, or a finding made pursuant to division (A)(3) of section 2307.93 of the Revised Code.

(B) An order is a final order that may be reviewed, affirmed, modified, or reversed, with or without retrial, when it is one of the following:

(1) An order that affects a substantial right in an action that in effect determines the action and prevents a judgment;

(2) An order that affects a substantial right made in a special proceeding or upon a summary application in an action after judgment;

(3) An order that vacates or sets aside a judgment or grants a new trial;

(4) An order that grants or denies a provisional remedy and to which both of the following apply:

(a) The order in effect determines the action with respect to the provisional remedy and prevents a judgment in the action in favor of the appealing party with respect to the provisional remedy.

(b) The appealing party would not be afforded a meaningful or effective remedy by an appeal following final judgment as to all proceedings, issues, claims, and parties in the action.

(5) An order that determines that an action may or may not be maintained as a class action;

(6) An order determining the constitutionality of any changes to the Revised Code made by Am. Sub. S.B. 281 of the 124th general assembly, including the amendment of sections 1751.67, 2117.06, 2305.11, 2305.15, 2305.234, 2317.02, 2317.54, 2323.56, 2711.21, 2711.22, 2711.23, 2711.24, 2743.02, 2743.43, 2919.16, 3923.63, 3923.64, 4705.15, and 5111.018 (renumbered as 5164.07 by H.B. 59 of the 130th general assembly), and the enactment of sections 2305.113, 2323.41, 2323.43, and 2323.55 of the Revised Code or any changes made by Sub. S.B. 80 of the 125th general assembly, including the amendment of sections 2125.02, 2305.10, 2305.131, 2315.18, 2315.19, and 2315.21 of the Revised Code;

(7) An order in an appropriation proceeding that may be appealed pursuant to division (B)(3) of section 163.09 of the Revised Code.

(C) When a court issues an order that vacates or sets aside a judgment or grants a new trial, the court, upon the request of either party, shall state in the order the grounds upon which the new trial is granted or the judgment vacated or set aside.

3/25/2015

(D) This section applies to and governs any action, including an appeal, that is pending in any court on July 22, 1998, and all claims filed or actions commenced on or after July 22, 1998, notwithstanding any provision of any prior statute or rule of law of this state.

Amended by 130th General Assembly File No. 25, HB 59, §101.01, eff. 9/29/2013.

Effective Date: 07-22-1998; 09-01-2004; 09-02-2004; 09-13-2004; 12-30-2004; 04-07-2005;
2007 SB7 10-10-2007

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing Appendix to the Fourth Brief of Cross-Appellant The Dayton Power and Light Company has been served via electronic mail, upon the following counsel of record, this 31st day of March, 2015:

Samuel C. Randazzo (0016386)
(Counsel of Record)
Frank P. Darr (0025469)
Matthew R. Pritchard (0088070)
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Appellant
Industrial Energy Users-Ohio
Michael DeWine (0009181)
Ohio Attorney General

William L. Wright (0018010)
Section Chief
(Counsel of Record)
Thomas W. McNamee (0017352)
Werner L. Margard (0024858)
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
Email: William.wright@puc.state.oh.us
Thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us
Werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us

Attorneys for Appellee
The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

Maureen R. Grady, Esq. (0020847)
(Counsel of Record)
Terri L. Etter (0067445)
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of The Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
Email: Maureen.grady@occ.ohio.gov
Terry.etter@occ.ohio.gov

Attorneys for Appellant
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Colleen L. Mooney, Esq.
Ohio Partners For Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45840
Email: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Attorney for Amicus Curiae
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

Ellis Jacobs, Esq.
Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc.
130 West First Street, Suite 700 East
Dayton, OH 45402
Email: ejacobs@ablelaw.org

Attorney for Amicus Curiae
Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey
Jeffrey S. Sharkey